

WAKE COUNTY FIRE COMMISSION

Thursday, July 16, 2015

Adopted Minutes

(Audio Replays of the meeting are available upon request)

A meeting of the Wake County Fire Commission was held on Thursday, July 16, 2015, 7:00 PM, in the Wake County Commons Building, Cary Drive, Raleigh, North Carolina.

CALL MEETING TO ORDER

Commission Chair Lucius Jones called the meeting to order.

The following members were present: Chair Lucius Jones, Chief Tony Mauldin (South Region), Chief Tim Pope (North Region), Chief Todd Wright (West Region), Chris Perry (East Region Alternate), Chief David Price (South Region Alternate), Chief Ron Early (North Region Alternate), Judge Keith Gregory (Citizen/Consumer), Billy Myrick (Citizen Consumer), Bob Stagg (Citizen Consumer), Judge Michael Denning (Citizen/Consumer), and Matt Calabria (Wake County Commissioner).

The following members were absent: Chief Garland Johnston (West Region Alternate), Chief Rodney Privette (East Region), Lee Price (Firefighters Association President), Ricky Wright (Citizen Consumer), and John Burns (Wake County Commissioner).

The following County officials and staff were present: Fire Services Director Nick Campasano, Budget and Policy Analyst Michael James, Director of Training Ricky Dorsey, Interim Chief Deputy Fire Marshal Darrell Alford, Emergency Services Manager Demetric Potts, and Cliff Freeman (Fire Services).

Vice Chair Billy Myrick gave an invocation.

ITEMS OF BUSINESS

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Upon motion of Billy Myrick and second by Bob Stagg, the Fire Commission unanimously approved the Agenda.

ADOPTION OF MINUTES

Bob Stagg and Chief Chris Perry requested that the minutes be updated to reflect that Chief Rodney Privette and Bob Stagg were not in attendance at the May 14, 2015 Fire Commission meeting, as well as add the section on public comments. With the requested modifications to the minutes noted and upon motion of Chief Chris Perry and second by Bob Stagg, the Fire Commission unanimously approved the minutes from the May 14, 2015 meeting.

REGULAR AGENDA

NO ACTIONS ITEMS

INFORMATION AGENDA

FOLLOW- UP INFORMATION: STAFFING AND COMPENSATION COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION TO INCREASE THE CURRENT 2008/2009 FIRE SERVICES PAY BAND MAXIMUMS BY TWO PERCENT

Budget and Policy Analyst Michael James reminded the Fire Commission of the proposal from the Staffing and Compensation Committee presented at the May meeting. He noted that there were some questions and information requested at the meeting so he was there to provide that information as well as try to answer any questions that you might have. Michael stated that before he got into the analysis he wanted to go over the data that was used and some of the assumptions that were made in the analysis and then he would get to the results.

Michael shared that that the salary data that was used came from each of the departments through their annual budget submissions so it may not exactly align with actual salary expenditures. Also, some of the employees had titles that were slightly different from the pay band titles, so a decision was made to place those employees in the classifications that made the most sense. He stated that we also assumed a 3% merit increase for each year of the out years. Michael stated that Cary Fire Department wasn't included in the analysis because our contract with them is on a per call basis; Swift Creek and Western Wake were also not included because we only give them part-time temporary salaries.

Michael referenced page 10 in the Fire Commission Agenda Packet, which identified what a 2% increase would be and who would be impacted. He stated that Table 1 included all the municipal departments and Table 2 excludes the municipal departments, and he shared that even if the band was increased by 2% there would still be people above the new maximum of the band.

Table 1

| Under Proposed Maximum Pay Band | | | |
|--|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| <i>Includes Municipal Departments</i> | | | |
| Pay Band Title | # Above Max (FY 2016) | # Above Max (FY 2017) | # Above Max (FY 2018) |
| Administrative Assistant I | 6 | 6 | 7 |
| Executive Secretary | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Probationary Firefighter | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Firefighter | 9 | 15 | 25 |
| Driver-Operator | 13 | 15 | 18 |
| Lieutenant | 2 | 6 | 10 |
| Captain | 5 | 12 | 16 |
| District Chief | 8 | 10 | 12 |
| Chief | 7 | 7 | 7 |
| Totals | 51 | 72 | 96 |

Table 2

| Under Proposed Maximum Pay Band | | | |
|--|------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|
| <i>Excludes Municipal Departments</i> | | | |
| Pay Band Title | # Above Max (FY 2016) | # Above Max (FY 2017) | # Above Max (FY 2018) |
| Administrative Assistant I | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Executive Secretary | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Probationary Firefighter | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Firefighter | 0 | 0 | 3 |
| Driver-Operator | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Lieutenant | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Captain | 3 | 5 | 7 |
| District Chief | 1 | 3 | 5 |
| Chief | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| Totals | 11 | 15 | 22 |

Michael shared that the next question that we looked at was what the pay bands would have to be if we were trying to get the maximums back to zero. He stated that this was shown in Table 3.

Table 3

| Title | Current Pay Plan | | | Proposal | Maximum Needed* | | | Increase Needed | | |
|----------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------|----------------|-------------------------|------------------------|----------------|----------------|------------------------|----------------|----------------|
| | Minimum | Midpoint | Maximum | 2 % Max Increase | FY 2016 | FY 2017 | FY 2018 | FY 2016 | FY 2017 | FY 2018 |
| Administrative Assistant I | 23,625 | 31,500 | 39,375 | 40,163 | 49,400 | 50,900 | 52,400 | 10,025 | 11,525 | 13,025 |
| Executive Secretary | 26,250 | 35,000 | 43,750 | 44,625 | 50,600 | 52,100 | 53,700 | 6,850 | 8,350 | 9,950 |
| Probationary Firefighter | 27,600 | 34,500 | 41,400 | 42,228 | 41,400 | 41,400 | 41,400 | - | - | - |
| Firefighter | 30,400 | 38,000 | 45,600 | 46,512 | 45,600 | 45,600 | 46,700 | - | - | 1,100 |
| Driver-Operator | 35,600 | 44,500 | 53,400 | 54,468 | 53,400 | 55,000 | 56,600 | - | 1,600 | 3,200 |
| Lieutenant | 38,400 | 48,000 | 57,600 | 58,752 | 57,600 | 57,600 | 57,600 | - | - | - |
| Captain | 44,800 | 56,000 | 67,200 | 68,544 | 72,200 | 74,300 | 76,600 | 5,000 | 7,100 | 9,400 |
| District Chief | 51,200 | 64,000 | 76,800 | 78,336 | 85,900 | 88,500 | 91,100 | 9,100 | 11,700 | 14,300 |
| Chief | 61,400 | 76,750 | 92,100 | 93,942 | 102,300 | 105,400 | 108,600 | 10,200 | 13,300 | 16,500 |

Michael stated that he wanted to be clear that this wasn't a staff recommendation it was provided just to give some perspective on where we are at right now, if you really wanted to get those numbers on Table 2 back to zero this is what you would have to do. Also, he stated that the numbers in Table 3 excludes all the municipals because they are not subject to our Compensation Guidelines.

Michael stated that there was a question about the fiscal impacts for raising the maximums of the pay bands. He commented that as stated at the May meeting raising the maximum bands will not have an additional fiscal impact beyond what is provided in annual merit increases; merit increases are budgeted as salary increases. Increasing the maximum band would only change how the increases are counted for the purposes of future retirement compensation. Finally he completed the presentation by sharing that Wake County Human Resources would be conducting a compensation study for the Fire Tax District later this year.

Commission Chair Lucius Jones asked if the County would be conducting a study and then they would bring back a recommendation to the Fire Commission for all positions. Michael stated that was his understanding that this would be a comprehensive study similar to what had been done in the past.

Director Campasano stated that when we had our meeting with the Manager's Office and representatives from Human Resources they stated it is really not the correct way to correct these issues. It is much better to look at the entire compensation rate, do the market analysis and then correct all of the positions at once. Along with the market analysis will be the identification of positions that currently don't exist in the County's positions. Director Campasano shared that we actually have a meeting tomorrow with the Chair of the Compensation and Staffing Committee, and Elaine Barnes the new Recruitment, Classification and Compensation Manager so we can get an idea of how we are going to move forward. Director Campasano stated that the information that HR requested should be in, we had asked the Compensation and Staffing Committee to have that information in by August 7th, and the study should be going out right after that, with the analysis and results coming back in September, and hopefully a recommendation to the Board of County Commissioners in October.

Commission Chair Lucius Jones stated that he didn't see a problem with that plan, and Commission Vice Chair Billy Myrick agreed. Chief Wright stated that he wanted to make sure that everyone was aware that if they didn't act on this that everyone that was at the top of the band would receive a one-time bonus instead of a merit. Chair Lucius Jones asked the Commission Members if they wanted to table making a decision until after the Market Survey and look at the overall picture and recommend changes at that time. Director Campasano stated that before they left this topic there was a separate sheet that they have in your packets that is a list of representative fire departments that the market analysis will include and the Manager's office asked that the Commission Members review this and provide any input or accept this if you feel that it is a good representative list.

Commission Chair Lucius Jones stated that he sees cities and towns on the list, but when we are looking at the funding mechanisms we are looking at funding the non-profits departments and more than half of them are not affiliated with municipalities. So couldn't all these salary comparisons wind up being cities and wouldn't that skew our numbers? Chief Pope stated that was where they were losing all their people to, and Chief Wright stated that because of that he recommends that Cary and Raleigh be added. Commission Chair Lucius Jones added that the unincorporated areas are shrinking and more growth is occurring in the municipalities and he is unsure how we will balance that formula, perhaps the municipalities will need to pay more and the County less. Commissioner Matt Calabria stated that he thinks there is an interest and an appetite for taking a fresh look at the whole scheme and try to understand what the issues are, what the best practices are and how best to structure this. He thinks that we have an opportunity for a lot of folks to look at it with open eyes. He thinks the work that we are doing is very helpful, doing the research doesn't guarantee a certain result, but the only way to get a better result is to do the research. He stated that he speaks for 1/7th of the Board but his sense is that once the appropriate information is queued up they were ready to look at it.

POST INCIDENT REVIEW

Ricky Dorsey, Fire Services Training Director reported that there were 5 Post Incident Reviews conducted from July 1, 2014 – June 30, 2015. One Post Incident Review for Bay Leaf, Garner, Holly Springs, and two for Fuquay-Varina Fire Departments. Training Director Dorsey shared the following Trending Discussions:

1. CAD is not currently able to identify dependable resources when staffing has been depleted already. The resource may be showing in service, but there are no available personnel for the unit.

2. Identify ways to dispatch elliptical tankers and pumper tankers as they have different capabilities.
3. There should be more mutual-aid training with each other to better prepare for large dwelling fires.
4. Medical rehab at incidents is going very well.
5. Rural Water Supply Challenges – large structures in non-hydrated areas
6. Companies are working well with each other
7. Accountability is going well overall on incidents
8. Transitional Fire Attack is being used more frequently with good results Civilian fatalities in low income situations – agencies were not able to make successful rescues due to late notifications and high heat conditions.

FIRE TAX DISTRICT FINANCIAL REPORT

Emergency Services Manager Demetric Potts provided the following Fire Tax Financial Reports to the Fire Commission Members for review/comment:

STANDING COMMITTEE UPDATES

Budget Committee:

Emergency Services Manager Demetric Potts provided the following summary of the Wake County Board of Commissioners adopted Fire Tax Budget Committee and Staff recommended Fiscal Year 2016 Operating Budget and Fiscal Year 2016 – 2022 Fire CIP:

Operative Policy Assumptions

- The single fire tax district created by the Board of Commissioners in 1999 should fund the full cost of fire service to residents of district, which contains all unincorporated areas as well as the Town of Wendell.
- When the County assumes the role of fiscal agent for Countywide public safety projects or operations, the Fire Tax District should be treated the same as municipal fire departments for the purposes of cost allocation.
- The Fire Tax District Budget should be balanced, sustainable, and reflect the priorities of the Board of Commissioners as advised by the Fire Commission.

Operating Budget Assumptions

- Use of Fund Balance: \$673,220
- Sustainability through FY18, given base assumptions
- The FY 2016 Base Budget reflects:
 - FY 2015 Adopted Budget plus Annualization of Merit for FY16 Allocated to Regular Salaries, FICA, Retirement, 401(k)
 - Overtime Held Constant with FY15
 - Part-time Held Constant with FY15
 - Wake Forest Board Compensation Held Constant with FY15
 - Health Insurance 20% Growth
 - Longevity, Life Insurance, Dental, Worker's Comp, Unemployment Comp, Volunteer Comp, State Pension, Long-term Disability taken from Department Submissions
 - Merit of 3% Added (Final To Be Determined)
- Assume same department revenue as FY15

Suspension of Sustainability Policy

- The FY 16 Budget temporarily suspends the Fire Commission's 5-year fund balance sustainability policy. The fund is currently projected to be sustainable through FY 2018 (3 years). In FY 2019, the ending fund balance is projected to dip below the goal of 16% of the subsequent year's operating budget.

Fire CIP (Approved by unanimous vote of the Budget Committee)

- Use of Uncommitted Funds: \$1,060,593
- FY16 projected to end at \$2,179,015
- Wendell Falls: Maintains funding for Wendell Falls acquisition in FY 17 in alignment with EMS County CIP; Prior Year Appropriation of \$350,000 - \$347,800 remains
- Bay leaf Rescue Truck: Includes the acquisition of Bay leaf Rescue 36 in FY 16 via cash with debt financing to reimburse CIP in FY 17 with other debt financings
- Defibrillators: Suspends Department acquisitions of FY 15 funded defibrillators to join the EMS RFP pricing; Equipment committee will identify a plan to replace defibs

Communications Committee:

Chief Chris Perry provided the following update for the Communications Committee:

The Communication Committee was formed as part of the Fire Commission's Committee restructuring in the end of 2014. The purpose of this committee is to address communications-related issues including, but not limited to, dispatch, radio, and the use of these systems. The committee consists of the appointed members by the Commission and non-voting attendees, including Raleigh-Wake Emergency Communications Center (RWECC) staff.

Since being formed, some of the significant activities of the committee and/or committee members include:

- Attend bi-monthly meetings with RWECC staff to identify and work through issue resolution
- Provided input and guidance relative to a new version of Emergency Fire Dispatch, which guide the dispatch of fire department units based on questions asked of 9-1-1 callers. This implementation also reduced call processing time on structure fires.
- Development of a radio programming template to be used as a basis for all county fire departments in recent reprogramming project.
- Provide input to RWECC staff on fire department-related dispatch protocol clarifications/changes
- Provide input on various selection committees, i.e. radio replacement consultant and CAD Administrator
- Provide input on projects to improve radio interoperability with other jurisdictions, especially out-of-county agencies.
- Participating in CAD replacement project, including service on Core CAD committee, attendance at vendor technology fair demonstrations, and one-on-one consultant interview sessions.

Some items on our horizon and "to-do" list include:

- Continue to provide input on the CAD replacement RFP, selection, and implementation
- Continue to provide input on the radio replacement RFP, selection, and implementation
- Research and develop a strategy to place CAD-capable devices in more fire vehicles, as determined appropriate. This could include mobile computer terminals, or some type of tablet device. These devices would provide CAD information to responding units.

Compensation and Staffing Committee:

Chief Tim Herman provided the following update for the Compensation and Staffing Committee:

The Compensation/Staffing Committee had its first meeting as a combined committee of the both the Compensation Committee and Staffing Committee on 1/28/2015. This newly formed committee has two main focuses for the current year: 1) Update the current Compensation Guidelines that were created in 2003, last updated in 2012, and 2) Work with Wake County Human Resources on providing the Fire Commission with an updated Market Survey for FY17.

- 1) We have updated over half of the Compensation Guidelines and are projected to have a draft version available for the Fire Commission to review in the fall of 2015.
- 2) Wake County HR is in the process of hiring the person that will assist the committee conduct the latest Market Survey which should be available to the Fire Commission in the late fall of 2015.

CHAIR REPORT

None

FIRE SERVICES INTERIM DIRECTOR REPORT

Director Campasano stated that he would like to take an opportunity to thank the Fire Services staff; he has not worked with such a great group of professionals. He stated that in addition to doing their jobs they have been baby-sitting him, feeding him information so he would like to thank all of them, they have been doing a fantastic job. He stated that he would like to thank all the Fire Chiefs in the County who have been very welcoming, inviting him into their stations and leading him by the hand to try to fill in that historical gap that he has in knowledge.

Director Campasano stated that the report that he has will be brief because we had covered some of the items. He wanted to talk about some of the major initiatives that former Director Wright had started prior to his departure. One of those being the Cost Share Analysis that the Commission had previously voted to approve and there was one element still outstanding which was the data source for the service demand piece. There were some discrepancies in what was posted in the report versus the reality of the break down in responses. He stated that we had recently had a meeting on July 9th with the Cost Share Committee; our County GIS printed up some maps for each of the eight cost share departments utilizing the Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) data highlighting the 2013 & 2014 call response within the municipal boundaries as well as the rural area. So we were able to identify where those discrepancies would be, and the Committee agreed on utilizing the CAD data as a source, so the Committee did vote to recommend to the Fire Commission that the CAD data be used as the source for the information for the service demand. Director Campasano stated that there are some identified deficiencies there, such as if your fire department is responding to a highway CAD will typically default to for example if the call is between two intersections / two ramps depending on where that call is CAD is going to default to the nearest intersection. So if you have repetitive calls on the highway it could incorrectly show that all of those calls are in the municipal district simply because that was the closets intersection. So we have identified that that happens. What we will now be doing is going through and looking at how often does this happen, and coming up with a vehicle so that when these formulas are put into effect the municipalities have an opportunity to review the data and then validate it. So that if there are any discrepancies in the data the municipalities will have an opportunity to appeal that data before the final rates are set.

Director Campasano stated that the other item that the Committee voted on was to recommend implementation of the Cost Share Formula for the next Fiscal Year 2017 budget. What County Fire Services will be doing in conjunction with that committee is coming up with some strategies for that implementation. He stated that initially he thinks the Cost Share Formula was part of the entire budget reset package, so that's a strategy, holding off until that entire formula is done. So we will come back to the Fire Commission with some strategies as action items in September so you can make some informed decisions. Talking about that whole budget reset, cost share, and standards of cover is just two of many measures that were laid out to achieve that budget reset. Among some being the analysis of health care benefit options which we need to look at, can we reduce the health care costs for all the fire departments and what vehicle would that look like. The personnel compensation study which is underway, so there is more than just the cost share formula, more than just the standards of cover, it was presented as best as he could see as a reset package.

Director Campasano also shared that Fire Services staff had been working on developing a process flow for vehicle purchases purchasing large as well as administrative vehicles, so we are trying to

come up with a standardized document to streamline that process so that all the departments that are receiving vehicles will know exactly what steps to follow. On July 30th we will have a meeting with the Apparatus Committee as well as Wake County Finance Procurement so that they can go over all of the legal requirements, and we are hoping to roll out the actual process in early to mid-August. So we will be bringing in all the departments that will be purchasing apparatus this year and going over the process giving them all the documents and then starting that purchasing process.

Director Campasano stated that as a final point one of the things that he has heard from many of the Fire Chiefs from the various departments is the communication piece or lack of communication, the ability for committees to share their information with Fire Services, as well as between each other. So what the staff has done is gone and began working with Wake County Technology Department and we have developed a Share Point Site, which if you are not familiar with that it looks like a Web Site, and there will be a main Share Point Site for the Fire Commission, we will have areas for you to post your agendas, post your minutes. There will be a comprehensive calendar, and each of the committees will have their own page they can put up a project. For example, the analysis of health care benefits, the Compensation and Staffing Committee can post that as a project, set their deadlines, set their meetings and all there meeting dates will go back to that main calendar on the main Fire Commission page, and then they can track their progress, you can track their progress, you will be able to go to one site to look at all the various committees. We are hoping to roll this out in mid to late August and we are hoping that now we will have a vehicle to increase that communication and kind of add some urgency and efficiency to the committees work, because if we are going to meet the reset items it is going to take all these committees to work effectively and efficiently as possible.

Bob Stagg commented that there has been discussion both on and off line from some of the Fire Chiefs in here as well as Raleigh, and the Sheriff about communications within buildings, and talk about the expansion of BDAs. Is that still being discussed or has that turned into a dead project? Director Campasano stated that he could not answer that question because he had not attended any of the 800 MHz radio meetings so he doesn't know where that stands. Chief Perry added that there has been a lot of discussion but very little action. He stated that there are several strategies that they are looking at such as code enforcement in terms of introducing some language in some of the fire code versions to give a mechanism to make some things happen, and some other strategies as well but that is such a big item for them right now.

OTHER BUSINESS

None.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

ADJOURNMENT

Being no further business, the meeting was adjourned